

Interval Techniques for Processing Educational Data

Olga Kosheleva¹, Vladik Kreinovich², Luc Longpré²,
Mourat Tschoshanov¹, and Gang Xiang²

¹Department of Teacher Education

²Department of Computer Science

University of Texas at El Paso

500 W. University

El Paso, TX 79968, USA

olgak@utep.edu, vladik@utep.edu, longpre@utep.edu

mouratt@utep.edu, gxiang@utep.edu

Interval Approach Is...
Interval Approach Is...
This Problem Is a...
How We Can Process...
Computing Variance...
Computing Variance...
Numerical Example:...
Numerical Example:...
Fuzzy Approach: In Brief
Need for Combining...
Simplest Case:...
Simplest Case:...
Simplified Case When...
Relation to Fuzzy Logic
Selecting an "Or"...
Selecting an "And"...
Selecting an "And"...
Selecting Implication...

[Title Page](#)

[⏪](#)

[⏩](#)

[◀](#)

[▶](#)

[Page 1 of 22](#)

[Go Back](#)

[Full Screen](#)

1. Formulation of the Problem

- Teaching is very important, and teaching is not always very effective.
- There exist many different pedagogical techniques.
- It is important to experimentally compare their effectiveness.
- *Traditional approach*: statistical techniques.
- *Problem*:
 - traditional techniques are tailored to processing numbers;
 - in education, we often have intervals (A means $[90,100]$) or fuzzy-type perceptions like “understands well”.
- *Conclusion*: we need new techniques to process such interval and fuzzy statistical data.

Interval Approach Is...

This Problem Is a...

How We Can Process...

Computing Variance...

Computing Variance...

Numerical Example:...

Numerical Example:...

Fuzzy Approach: In Brief

Need for Combining...

Simplest Case:...

Simplest Case:...

Simplified Case When...

Relation to Fuzzy Logic

Selecting an “Or”...

Selecting an “And”...

Selecting an “And”...

Selecting Implication...

Title Page

◀◀

▶▶

◀

▶

Page 2 of 22

Go Back

Full Screen

2. Problems with the Traditional Approach: Example

- How do we select a teaching method?
- *Main criterion:* good average results m : e.g., good average grade.
- *Also important:* ensure that the results are consistently good, i.e., standard deviation σ is low.
- *Example:*
 - in one method, all the students got Bs,
 - in the other method, half of the students got Bs and half of the students got As.
- *Traditional approach:* $A = 4$, $B = 3$, so:
 - In the first method, $m = 3$ and $\sigma = 0$.
 - In the second method, $m = 3.5$ and $\sigma = 0.5$.
- *Conclusion:* second method is less stable.

3. Problems with the Traditional Approach: Example cont-d

- In reality:
 - in the first method, half of the students got 80, half 88; and
 - in the second method, half of the students got 89, and half 91.
- Then:
 - In the first method, the average is $m = \frac{80 + 88}{2} = 84$, and $\sigma = 4$.
 - In the second method, the average is $m = \frac{89 + 91}{2} = 90$, and $\sigma = 1 \ll 4$.
- *Conclusion*: second method is actually *more* stable.
- *What is necessary*: we want methods that would:
 - take interval uncertainty into account and thus
 - provide guaranteed answers to questions like:

“Is the first method better than the second one?”.

4. Interval Approach Is Needed

- *Main problem:* letter grade ℓ represents an *interval* $\mathbf{x} = [\underline{x}, \bar{x}]$ of possible values of the number grade.
- *Examples:*
 - the letter grade A represents the interval $[90, 100]$;
 - the letter grade B represents the interval $[80, 90]$;
 - the letter grade C represents the interval $[70, 80]$.
- *Main objective:* given a set of letter grades ℓ_1, \dots, ℓ_n , to compute a certain statistical characteristic C such as:
 - average, standard deviation,
 - correlation with other characteristics (such as the family income or the amount of time that a student spends on homeworks).
- *Traditional approach:* the statistical characteristic is defined in terms of numerical values, as $C = C(x_1, \dots, x_n)$.
- *Examples:* the population average $m = \frac{x_1 + \dots + x_n}{n}$, the population variance $V = \frac{1}{n} \cdot \sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - m)^2$.

[Interval Approach Is ...](#)[This Problem Is a ...](#)[How We Can Process ...](#)[Computing Variance ...](#)[Computing Variance ...](#)[Numerical Example: ...](#)[Numerical Example: ...](#)[Fuzzy Approach: In Brief](#)[Need for Combining ...](#)[Simplest Case: ...](#)[Simplest Case: ...](#)[Simplified Case When ...](#)[Relation to Fuzzy Logic](#)[Selecting an "Or" ...](#)[Selecting an "And" ...](#)[Selecting an "And" ...](#)[Selecting Implication ...](#)[Title Page](#)[◀◀](#)[▶▶](#)[◀](#)[▶](#)[Page 5 of 22](#)[Go Back](#)[Full Screen](#)

5. Interval Approach Is Needed (cont-d)

- *Specific feature of educational data:*
 - instead of the *exact* values x_i ,
 - we often only know the *intervals* \mathbf{x}_i corresponding to the letter grade ℓ_i .
- *Problem:*
 - for different possible values $x_1 \in \mathbf{x}_1, \dots, x_n \in \mathbf{x}_n$,
 - we get different values of the corresponding characteristic C .
- *Objective:* given:
 - the characteristic $C(x_1, \dots, x_n)$ and
 - the intervals $\mathbf{x}_1, \dots, \mathbf{x}_n$ of possible values of x_1, \dots, x_n ,

find the range of possible values $C(x_1, \dots, x_n)$ of the desired characteristic when $x_i \in \mathbf{x}_i$.

- *Objective reformulated in mathematical terms:* find the interval

$$\mathbf{C} = \{C(x_1, \dots, x_n) \mid x_1 \in \mathbf{x}_1, \dots, x_n \in \mathbf{x}_n\}.$$

Interval Approach Is ...

This Problem Is a ...

How We Can Process ...

Computing Variance ...

Computing Variance ...

Numerical Example: ...

Numerical Example: ...

Fuzzy Approach: In Brief

Need for Combining ...

Simplest Case: ...

Simplest Case: ...

Simplified Case When ...

Relation to Fuzzy Logic

Selecting an "Or" ...

Selecting an "And" ...

Selecting an "And" ...

Selecting Implication ...

Title Page

◀◀

▶▶

◀

▶

Page 6 of 22

Go Back

Full Screen

6. This Problem Is a Particular Case of the General Problem of Interval Computations

- The need to perform computations under interval uncertainty occurs in many areas of science and engineering.
- In many such areas, we therefore face the following problem:
 - we know:
 - * n intervals $\mathbf{x}_1, \dots, \mathbf{x}_n$ and
 - * an algorithm $y = f(x_1, \dots, x_n)$ that transforms n real numbers (inputs) into a single number y (result of data processing);
 - we must estimate the range of possible values of y , i.e., the interval

$$\mathbf{y} = \{f(x_1, \dots, x_n) \mid x_1 \in \mathbf{x}_1, \dots, x_n \in \mathbf{x}_n\}.$$

- This problem is called the main problem of *interval computations*.
- *Conclusion*: the problem of processing educational data under interval uncertainty is a particular case of the more general problem of interval computations.

[Interval Approach Is...](#)[This Problem Is a...](#)[How We Can Process...](#)[Computing Variance...](#)[Computing Variance...](#)[Numerical Example...](#)[Numerical Example...](#)[Fuzzy Approach: In Brief](#)[Need for Combining...](#)[Simplest Case:...](#)[Simplest Case:...](#)[Simplified Case When...](#)[Relation to Fuzzy Logic](#)[Selecting an "Or"...](#)[Selecting an "And"...](#)[Selecting an "And"...](#)[Selecting Implication...](#)[Title Page](#)[◀◀](#)[▶▶](#)[◀](#)[▶](#)[Page 7 of 22](#)[Go Back](#)[Full Screen](#)

7. How We Can Process Interval Data: General Description

- *General case:* many efficient techniques are known.
- *Statistical case:* several algorithms have been developed for the case when the the function $f(x_1, \dots, x_n)$ is one of the standard statistical characteristics such as average m or standard deviation V ;
- *Specific feature of average:* average m is a monotonic function of each of its variables.
- *Conclusion:*
 - its value is the largest when each x_i attains the largest possible value $x_i = \bar{x}_i$, and
 - its value is the smallest when the variance attains its smallest possible value \underline{x}_i .
- Thus, for the average m , the interval takes the form $[\underline{m}, \bar{m}]$, where

$$\underline{m} = \frac{\underline{x}_1 + \dots + \underline{x}_n}{n}; \quad \bar{m} = \frac{\bar{x}_1 + \dots + \bar{x}_n}{n}.$$

Interval Approach Is...

This Problem Is a...

How We Can Process...

Computing Variance...

Computing Variance...

Numerical Example...

Numerical Example...

Fuzzy Approach: In Brief

Need for Combining...

Simplest Case:...

Simplest Case:...

Simplified Case When...

Relation to Fuzzy Logic

Selecting an "Or"...

Selecting an "And"...

Selecting an "And"...

Selecting Implication...

Title Page

◀◀

▶▶

◀

▶

Page 8 of 22

Go Back

Full Screen

8. Computing Variance Under Interval Uncertainty

- *Bad news:* in general, for interval uncertainty, computing the range $[\underline{V}, \overline{V}]$ of variance V is NP-hard.
- *Specific case:* for educational data, intervals can only “touch”.
- *Good news:* in such case, there is an efficient algorithm.
- *Algorithm for computing \overline{V} :*

- First, we sort the grades into an increasing sequence for which $\underline{x}_1 \leq \underline{x}_2 \leq \dots \leq \underline{x}_n$ and $\overline{x}_1 \leq \overline{x}_2 \leq \dots \leq \overline{x}_n$.
- For every k from 1 to n ,
 - * we pick $x_i = \underline{x}_i$ for $i \leq k$ and $x_i = \overline{x}_i$ for $i > k$;
 - * then, we compute the average $m = \frac{x_1 + \dots + x_n}{n}$ of the selected x_i , and
 - * check whether this average satisfies the inequality

$$\underline{x}_k \leq m \leq \overline{x}_{k+1}.$$

- * If it does, then the population variance of the corresponding sequence x_1, \dots, x_n is exactly the desired upper bound \overline{V} .

9. Computing Variance Under Interval Uncertainty (contd)

- To compute the lower bound \underline{V} , similarly, for every k ,
 - we select:
 - * $x_i = \bar{x}_i$ when $\bar{x}_i \leq \underline{x}_k$, and
 - * $x_i = \underline{x}_i$ when $\underline{x}_i \geq \bar{x}_k$.
 - We then compute the average m of the selected x_i and check whether this average satisfies the inequality

$$\underline{x}_k \leq m \leq \bar{x}_k.$$

- If it does, then:
 - * we assign $x_i = m$ for all the un-assigned value i , and
 - * the population variance of the corresponding sequence x_1, \dots, x_n is exactly the desired lower bound \underline{V} .

10. Numerical Example: Computing \bar{V}

- *Situation:* sorted grades are C, B, and A, so $\underline{x}_1 = 70$, $\bar{x}_1 = 80$, $\underline{x}_2 = 80$, $\bar{x}_2 = 90$, $\underline{x}_3 = 90$, $\bar{x}_3 = 100$.
- For $k = 1$, we pick:
 - $x_1 = \underline{x}_1 = 70$,
 - $x_2 = \bar{x}_2 = 90$, and
 - $x_3 = \bar{x}_3 = 100$.
- Here, $m = \frac{x_1 + x_2 + x_3}{3} = 86\frac{2}{3}$.
- Here, $\underline{x}_1 = 70 \leq m \leq \bar{x}_2 = 90$.
- So, the upper bound \bar{V} is equal to the population variance $\frac{1}{n} \cdot \sum_{i=1}^n (x_i - m)^2$ of the values $x_1 = 70$, $x_2 = 90$, and $x_3 = 100$.
- Conclusion: $\bar{V} = 102\frac{2}{9}$.

[Interval Approach Is...](#)[This Problem Is a...](#)[How We Can Process...](#)[Computing Variance...](#)[Computing Variance...](#)[Numerical Example:...](#)[Numerical Example:...](#)[Fuzzy Approach: In Brief](#)[Need for Combining...](#)[Simplest Case:...](#)[Simplest Case:...](#)[Simplified Case When...](#)[Relation to Fuzzy Logic](#)[Selecting an "Or"...](#)[Selecting an "And"...](#)[Selecting an "And"...](#)[Selecting Implication...](#)[Title Page](#)[◀◀](#)[▶▶](#)[◀](#)[▶](#)[Page 11 of 22](#)[Go Back](#)[Full Screen](#)

11. Numerical Example: Computing \underline{V}

- *Situation:* sorted grades are C, B, and A, so $\underline{x}_1 = 70$, $\bar{x}_1 = 80$, $\underline{x}_2 = 80$, $\bar{x}_2 = 90$, $\underline{x}_3 = 90$, $\bar{x}_3 = 100$.
- For $k = 1$, we assign $x_2 = \underline{x}_2 = 80$ and $x_3 = \underline{x}_3 = 90$.
- Their average $m = 85$ is outside the interval $[\underline{x}_1, \bar{x}_1] = [70, 80]$, so we have to consider the next k .
- For $k = 2$, we assign $x_1 = \bar{x}_1 = 80$ and $x_3 = \underline{x}_3 = 90$.
- Their average $m = 85$ of these two values satisfies the inequality $\underline{x}_2 = 80 \leq m \leq \bar{x}_2 = 90$.
- Hence we assign $x_2 = 85$, and compute \underline{V} as the population variance of the values $x_1 = 80$, $x_2 = 85$, and $x_3 = 90$.
- Conclusion: $\underline{V} = 16\frac{2}{3}$.

[Interval Approach Is...](#)[This Problem Is a...](#)[How We Can Process...](#)[Computing Variance...](#)[Computing Variance...](#)[Numerical Example:...](#)[Numerical Example:...](#)[Fuzzy Approach: In Brief](#)[Need for Combining...](#)[Simplest Case:...](#)[Simplest Case:...](#)[Simplified Case When...](#)[Relation to Fuzzy Logic](#)[Selecting an "Or"...](#)[Selecting an "And"...](#)[Selecting an "And"...](#)[Selecting Implication...](#)[Title Page](#)[◀◀](#)[▶▶](#)[◀](#)[▶](#)[Page 12 of 22](#)[Go Back](#)[Full Screen](#)

12. Fuzzy Approach: In Brief

- *The main idea behind fuzzy uncertainty:*
 - instead of just describing which objects (in our case, grades) are possible,
 - we also describe, for each object x , the degree $\mu(x)$ to which this object is possible.
- For each degree of possibility α , we can determine the set of objects that are possible with at least this degree of possibility.
- *Comment:* this set is called the α -cut $\{x \mid \mu(x) \geq \alpha\}$ of the original fuzzy set.
- *How we can process fuzzy data: general idea.*
 - Instead of an interval \mathbf{x}_i , we have a family of nested intervals $\mathbf{x}_i(\alpha)$ – α -cuts of the given fuzzy sets.
 - *Objective:* compute the fuzzy number corresponding to this the desired characteristic $C(x_1, \dots, x_n)$.
 - *How:* for each α , apply the interval algorithm to the α -cuts $\mathbf{x}_i(\alpha)$ of the corresponding fuzzy sets.
 - The resulting nested intervals form the desired fuzzy set for C .

Interval Approach Is ...
This Problem Is a ...
How We Can Process ...
Computing Variance ...
Computing Variance ...
Numerical Example: ...
Numerical Example: ...
Fuzzy Approach: In Brief
Need for Combining ...
Simplest Case: ...
Simplest Case: ...
Simplified Case When ...
Relation to Fuzzy Logic
Selecting an "Or" ...
Selecting an "And" ...
Selecting an "And" ...
Selecting Implication ...

Title Page



Page 13 of 22

Go Back

Full Screen

13. Need for Combining Probabilistic, Interval, and Fuzzy Uncertainty

- In the case of *interval* uncertainty,
 - we consider all possible values of the grades, and
 - we do not make any assumptions about the probability p of different values within the corresponding intervals.
- *In reality*: in many cases, we have commonsense ideas about p .
- *Example 1*:
 - *fact*: a student has almost all As but only one B;
 - *conclusion*: this is a strong student;
 - *prediction*: this B is at the high end of the B interval.
- *Example 2*:
 - *fact*: a student has almost all Cs but only one B;
 - *conclusion*: this is a weak student;
 - *prediction*: this B is at the lower end of the B interval.
- It is desirable to take such arguments into account when processing educational data.

Interval Approach Is . . .
This Problem Is a . . .
How We Can Process . . .
Computing Variance . . .
Computing Variance . . .
Numerical Example: . . .
Numerical Example: . . .
Fuzzy Approach: In Brief
Need for Combining . . .
Simplest Case: . . .
Simplest Case: . . .
Simplified Case When . . .
Relation to Fuzzy Logic
Selecting an "Or" . . .
Selecting an "And" . . .
Selecting an "And" . . .
Selecting Implication . . .

Title Page



Page 14 of 22

Go Back

Full Screen

14. Simplest Case: Normally Distributed Grades

- *Situation:* actual number grades are normally distributed, with an (unknown) mean m and an unknown standard deviation σ .
- *In precise terms:* the cumulative probability distribution (cdf) $F(x) \stackrel{\text{def}}{=} \text{Prob}(\xi < x)$ has the form $F_0\left(\frac{x-m}{\sigma}\right)$, where $F_0(x)$ is the cdf of the standard Gaussian distribution with 0 mean and unit standard deviation.
- *Our objective:* determine the values m and σ .
- *Case of number grades:* if we knew the values of the number grades x_i , then we could apply the above statistics and estimate m and $\sigma = \sqrt{V}$.
- *Case of letter grades:* based on the letter grades, we can find, for the threshold values 60, 70, etc., the frequency with which we have the grade smaller than this threshold.
- *Notations:* denote by f the proportion of F grades, by d the proportion of D grades.
- *Conclusion:* the frequency of $x < 60$ is f , the frequency of $x < 70$ is $f + d$, the frequency of $x < 80$ is $f + d + c$, etc.

[Interval Approach Is...](#)[This Problem Is a...](#)[How We Can Process...](#)[Computing Variance...](#)[Computing Variance...](#)[Numerical Example:...](#)[Numerical Example:...](#)[Fuzzy Approach: In Brief](#)[Need for Combining...](#)[Simplest Case:...](#)[Simplest Case:...](#)[Simplified Case When...](#)[Relation to Fuzzy Logic](#)[Selecting an "Or"...](#)[Selecting an "And"...](#)[Selecting an "And"...](#)[Selecting Implication...](#)[Title Page](#)[◀◀](#)[▶▶](#)[◀](#)[▶](#)[Page 15 of 22](#)[Go Back](#)[Full Screen](#)

15. Simplest Case: Towards an Algorithm

- *Idea*: probability \approx frequency:

$$F_0\left(\frac{60-m}{\sigma}\right) \approx f; \quad F_0\left(\frac{70-m}{\sigma}\right) \approx f+d;$$

$$F_0\left(\frac{80-m}{\sigma}\right) \approx f+d+c; \quad F_0\left(\frac{90-m}{\sigma}\right) \approx f+d+c+b.$$

- *Simplification*: let us denote by $\psi_0(t)$ the function that is inverse to $F_0(t)$.
- *Result*: the first equality takes the form $60 - m/\sigma \approx \psi_0(f)$, i.e., $\sigma \cdot \psi_0(f) + m \approx 60$.
- *Result*: to find the unknowns m and σ , we get a system of linear equations:

$$\sigma \cdot \psi_0(f) + m \approx 60; \quad \sigma \cdot \psi_0(f+d) + m \approx 70;$$

$$\sigma \cdot \psi_0(f+d+c) + m \approx 80; \quad \sigma \cdot \psi_0(f+d+c+b) + m \approx 90.$$

- *How we can solve it*: e.g., Least Squares.
- *Comment*: if the distribution is non-Gaussian, and we know its shape, i.e., $F(x) = F_0((x-m)/\sigma)$ for known $F_0(t)$, then we can similarly find m and σ .

Interval Approach Is...
This Problem Is...
How We Can Process...
Computing Variance...
Computing Variance...
Numerical Example:...
Numerical Example:...
Fuzzy Approach: In Brief
Need for Combining...
Simplest Case:...
Simplest Case:...
Simplified Case When...
Relation to Fuzzy Logic
Selecting an "Or"...
Selecting an "And"...
Selecting an "And"...
Selecting Implication...

Title Page



Page 16 of 22

Go Back

Full Screen

16. Simplified Case When All the Grades Are $\geq C$

- *Real-life situation:* in many cases, only C and above is an acceptable grade.
- In such situations, $f = d = 0$ and $c + b + a = 1$, so we get a simplified system of two linear equations with two unknowns:

$$\sigma \cdot \psi_0(c) + m = 80; \quad \sigma \cdot \psi_0(c + b) + m = 90.$$

- *Simplification:* subtracting the first equation from the second one, we conclude that $\sigma = \frac{10}{\psi_0(b + c) - \psi_0(c)}$.
- *Further simplification;* this formula can be further simplified if the distribution $F_0(x)$ is symmetric (e.g., Gaussian distribution is symmetric), i.e., for every x ,
 - the probability $F_0(-x)$ that $\xi \leq -x$ is equal to
 - the probability $1 - F_0(x)$ that $\xi \geq x$.
- *Simplified result:*

$$\sigma = -\frac{10}{\psi_0(a) + \psi_0(c)}; \quad m = 80 + \frac{10}{1 + \frac{\psi_0(a)}{\psi_0(c)}}.$$

[Interval Approach Is ...](#)[This Problem Is a ...](#)[How We Can Process ...](#)[Computing Variance ...](#)[Computing Variance ...](#)[Numerical Example: ...](#)[Numerical Example: ...](#)[Fuzzy Approach: In Brief](#)[Need for Combining ...](#)[Simplest Case: ...](#)[Simplest Case: ...](#)[Simplified Case When ...](#)[Relation to Fuzzy Logic](#)[Selecting an "Or" ...](#)[Selecting an "And" ...](#)[Selecting an "And" ...](#)[Selecting Implication ...](#)[Title Page](#)[◀◀](#)[▶▶](#)[◀](#)[▶](#)[Page 17 of 22](#)[Go Back](#)[Full Screen](#)

17. Relation to Fuzzy Logic

- *Reminder:*

$$\sigma = -\frac{10}{\psi_0(a) + \psi_0(c)}; \quad m = 80 + \frac{10}{1 + \frac{\psi_0(a)}{\psi_0(c)}}.$$

- *Conclusion 1:* σ is an increasing function of the sum $\psi_0(a) + \psi_0(c)$.
- *Conclusion 2:* m is monotonically increasing with the ratio $\psi_0(a)/|\psi_0(c)|$.
- *Explanation:* $\psi_0(a)$ monotonically depends on the proportion a of grades in the A range:
 - the more grades are in the A range and
 - the fewer grades are in the C range,
 - the larger the average grade m .
- So m should be kind of monotonically depending on the degree to which it is true that we have A grades and not C grades.
- *Comment:* the operations of:
 - sum as “or” and
 - ratio as “ a and not c ”

naturally appear in fuzzy logic.

Interval Approach Is...

This Problem Is a...

How We Can Process...

Computing Variance...

Computing Variance...

Numerical Example:...

Numerical Example:...

Fuzzy Approach: In Brief

Need for Combining...

Simplest Case:...

Simplest Case:...

Simplified Case When...

Relation to Fuzzy Logic

Selecting an “Or”...

Selecting an “And”...

Selecting an “And”...

Selecting Implication...

Title Page

◀◀

▶▶

◀

▶

Page 18 of 22

Go Back

Full Screen

18. Selecting an “Or” Operation

- The degree of belief a in a statement A can be estimated as proportional to the number of arguments in favor of A .
- In principle, there exist infinitely many potential arguments.
- So, in general, it is hardly probable that
 - when we pick a arguments out of infinitely many and then
 - we pick b out of infinitely many,the corresponding sets will have a common element.
- Thus, it is reasonable to assume that every argument in favor of A is different from every argument in favor of B .
- Under this assumption, the total number of arguments in favor of A and arguments in favor of B is equal to $a + b$.
- *Conclusion:* the natural degree of belief in $A \vee B$ is proportional to $a + b$.

[Interval Approach Is ...](#)[This Problem Is a ...](#)[How We Can Process ...](#)[Computing Variance ...](#)[Computing Variance ...](#)[Numerical Example: ...](#)[Numerical Example: ...](#)[Fuzzy Approach: In Brief](#)[Need for Combining ...](#)[Simplest Case: ...](#)[Simplest Case: ...](#)[Simplified Case When ...](#)[Relation to Fuzzy Logic](#)[Selecting an “Or” ...](#)[Selecting an “And” ...](#)[Selecting an “And” ...](#)[Selecting Implication ...](#)[Title Page](#)[◀◀](#)[▶▶](#)[◀](#)[▶](#)[Page 19 of 22](#)[Go Back](#)[Full Screen](#)

19. Selecting an “And” Operation

- Different experts are reliable to different degrees.
- Our degree of belief in a statement A made by an expert is $w \& a$, where:
 - w is our degree of belief in this expert, and
 - a is the expert’s degree of belief in the statement A .
- What are the natural properties of the “and”-operation?
- First, since $A \& B$ means the same as $B \& A$, we have $a \& b = b \& a$.
- Second, when an expert makes two statements B and C , then our resulting degree of belief in $B \vee C$ can be computed in two different ways:
 - We can first compute *his* degree of belief $b \vee c$ in $B \vee C$, and then use the “and”-operation to generate our degree of belief $w \& (b \vee c)$.
 - We can also first generate our degrees $w \& b$ and $w \& c$, and then use an “or”-operation to combine these degrees, arriving at $(w \& b) \vee (w \& c)$.

Interval Approach Is...
This Problem Is a...
How We Can Process...
Computing Variance...
Computing Variance...
Numerical Example:...
Numerical Example:...
Fuzzy Approach: In Brief
Need for Combining...
Simplest Case:...
Simplest Case:...
Simplified Case When...
Relation to Fuzzy Logic
Selecting an “Or”...
Selecting an “And”...
Selecting an “And”...
Selecting Implication...

Title Page



Page 20 of 22

Go Back

Full Screen

20. Selecting an “And” Operation (cont-d)

- *Reminder:*
 - We can first compute *his* degree of belief $b \vee c$ in $B \vee C$, and then use the “and”-operation to generate our degree of belief $w \& (b \vee c)$.
 - We can also first generate our degrees $w \& b$ and $w \& c$, and then use an “or”-operation to combine these degrees, arriving at $(w \& b) \vee (w \& c)$.
- It is natural to require that both ways lead to the same degree of belief, i.e., that the “and”-operation be distributive with respect to \vee .
- *Reasonable:* $w \& a$ is (non-strictly) increasing function.
- It can be shown that every commutative, distributive, and monotonic operation $\& : R \times R \rightarrow R$ has the form $a \& b = C \cdot a \cdot b$ for some $C > 0$.
- This expression can be further simplified if we introduce a new scale of degrees of belief $a' \stackrel{\text{def}}{=} C \cdot a$; in the new scale, $a \& b = a \cdot b$.

Interval Approach Is...
This Problem Is a...
How We Can Process...
Computing Variance...
Computing Variance...
Numerical Example:...
Numerical Example:...
Fuzzy Approach: In Brief
Need for Combining...
Simplest Case:...
Simplest Case:...
Simplified Case When...
Relation to Fuzzy Logic
Selecting an “Or”...
Selecting an “And”...
Selecting an “And”...
Selecting Implication...

Title Page



Page 21 of 22

Go Back

Full Screen

21. Selecting Implication and Negation

- *Selecting implication – idea:* an implication $A \rightarrow B$ is a statement C such that if we add C to A , we get B .
- *Reformulation:* in other words, $(a \rightarrow b) \& a = b$.
- *Resulting selection of implication:* since $a \& b = a \cdot b$, we get $a \rightarrow b = b/a$.
- *Negation – idea:* $\neg A$ can be viewed as a particular case of implication, $A \rightarrow F$, for a false value F .
- *Question:* how do we select the value e_0 corresponding to “false” F ?
- *Idea:* we know that “false” and “false” is “false”.
- *Reformulation:* in other words, $e_0 \& e_0 = e_0$.
- *Resulting selection of “false”:* since $a \& b = a \cdot b$, this implies that $e_0 = 1$.
- *Resulting selection of negation:* negation $A \rightarrow F$ is equal to $a \rightarrow e_0$, i.e., to $1/a$.
- *Conclusion:* “ A and not B ” means $a \cdot (1/b) = a/b$; this is exactly the operation we wanted.